Credit to slick for making the og doc but I wanna add some extra details to it
For Rhys's scheme, he would have needed to predict and manipulate Joe in order to perceive Roald as the suspect.



Suspect pool:
P1: Only Sundry House members would know where Malcom is seen as Joe was taking him to his place.
C1: It must be a Sundry House member or at least someone who associates with Sundry House at the bare minimum.

Joe:
P2: Malcom died in Joe's apartment.
P3: Joe knows what he's capable of.

P4: Joe sees himself as dangerous.
P5: Joe cannot rule himself out completely as Malcom insulted Marriane which could've given himself the motive to kill Malcolm and he blacked out giving himself the timeframe as well without him directly remembering it.
C2: Joe might be a suspect.
P6: Joe receives a "text" from the Eat The Rich Killer.
C3: Joe is DEFINITELY not the suspect.

Sophie:
P7: Sophie's grief is completely performative.
P8: Sophie uses death for clout; she is more focused on attention and money than anything else, even using her brother's death to promote her platform etc.
P9: Sophie shows no fear, guilt, or avoidance from the fact.
C4: Sophie is not a suspect very low on Joe's list.

Phoebe:
P10: Phoebe is over medicated, fragile, overwhelmed, she is a mess mentally and emotionally unstable.
P11: Phoebe's grief is chaotic and not calculated in the slightest.
P12: Phoebe lacks the temperament for violence.
C5: Phoebe is not a suspect.

Gemma:
P13: Gemma is cruel but ultimately very lazy.
P14: Gemma displays little grief.
P15: Gemma has no discipline, motive or even the intelligence for the killings add on the fact she mainly takes adderall/drugs with other lazy vices.
P16: Gemma is too self-absorbed for murder she barely even seems to acknowledge Malcom's existence or even be aware of him but it is plausible she is putting on a performance but again based off the other

evidence the first option is more likely again a mix of laziness self centeredness lack of discipline the ambition to kill somebody and seemingly skillset needed to become a killer makes her lower on the list.
C6: Gemma is not a main suspect.

Blessing:
P17: Blessing is detached and spiritual.
P18: Blessing avoids discomfort and risk.
P19: Blessing has no actual motive to kill them let alone plan it out methodically.
P20: Blessing is not violent, it's hard to see her have the nerve to kill somebody.
C7: Blessing is not definitive but also low on the list as a suspect.

Connie:
P21: Connie has a direct financial connection to Malcom from horse betting owing him money later it’s shown in Malcom’s book he had a lot of bets giving him a somewhat plausible explanation for why he had conflict with Malcom.
P22: But Connie is a drug addict and alcoholic; he is impulsive and chaotic; he can barely manage his own life, let alone plan out a complex spree of murders.
P23: Connie has no full coherent motive or discipline to kill somebody or plan out something this complex.
C8: Connie is unlikely a suspect due to his poor lifestyle, his lack of full motivation to harm Malcom besides money and overall lack of discipline to commit such crimes.

Simon:
P24: Simon is an artist fraud, exploitative, morally corrupt also while being snarky and entitled.

P25: Simon is capable of betrayal and exploitation as he exploited many young artists and used them for personal gain.
P26: Simon could be tied to Malcolm's blackmail world as a motive to kill him.
C9: Simon might be the killer and Joe does initially Simon is the killer wanting to expose him.
P27: Simon is killed by the Eat The Rick Killer
C10: Simon is DEFINITELY not a suspect.

Victor:
P29: Victor is Phoebe's bodyguard and is usually the one with her at most of these events .
P30: Victor's role as a bodyguard does grant him access to the scenes but since he is with Adam or Phoebe it limits his mobility.
P31: Victor has no clear personal motivation or ties to most of the victims, his only plausible motive is jealousy against the rich, the outsider bodyguard who wants to kill his wealthy bosses but again these aren't as deeply personal or theratucak as the etr killer. While he does have the physical ability or skillset to commit these acts of violence but maybe not the organization or planning skills to.
P32: Victor is more of an observer than a participant which further suggests he lacks the personal connection or resentment to the victims which makes it harder to establish a strong motivation to kill them.
C11: Victor is not high on the list; he is on the lower-middle end of it.
P33: Victor is killed by Joe.
P34: Joe receives the message from the Eat The Rich Killer Joe acknowledges the killer wanted Vic to find Malcom's ring so Joe could kill him.
C12: Victor is DEFINITELY not a suspect.

Kate:
P35: Kate is trustworthy despite showing a rough personality. She is kind by helping blue by paying for her rehab. She's hiding the fact that

she isn't a completely terrible person which is in contrast to the other elites of the group who publicly show their philanthropy
P36 Kate's grief is genuine; she was genuinely grieving ver Malcom's death and also when Malcom died she was sending him a voice message sounding angry at him implying she still thought Malcom was alive but also she might've kept that as a recording if she was a smart murderer and trying to conceal her acts.
P36: Kate is trustworthy despite showing a rough personality.
C13: Kate is not a suspect due to her more genuine behaviors and the fact she even reported Joe to the authorities she is willing to involve law enforcement which makes it less likely she's the killer.

Adam:
P37: Adam is deceptive.
P38: Adam shows ambiguous grief.
P39: Adam is very much capable of hiding wrongdoing due to him being arrested before and having a past experience with crime.
P40: Adam has a motive for secrets as he was in Malcom's notes for blackmail as Louis the son king even being nervous when his name was brought up, but not for murder he is more self centered, money hungry and his family's disappointment/embarrassment then a killer.
P41: Joe sees Adam as capable of framing someone but not killing them. Adam also warned Joe that Malcolm might blackmail him if Adam was the killer it would be more likely he would avoid the topic not actively warn Joe of Malcom's blackmail
C14: Adam is likely not a main suspect; he remains in the middle of the list either a typical stunted American man or a killer/framer.

Rhys:
P42: Rhys is running for mayor soon.
P43: Rhys's public crying could be genuine or manipulative.
P44: Rhys's travel references imply mobility.
P45: Rhys's public role complicates killing.

C15: Rhys is not a major suspect there's no known motive for now.

Roald:
P46: Roald has no fear shown at the funeral.
P47: Roald's is showing arrogance, and not sadness he is either the killer or too arrogant to see himself as mortal.
P48: Roald controls Kate possessively.
P49: Roald is being very territorial/protective over her at the funeral. Is he either being protective of her or him taunting Joe.
P50: Roald is obsessed with Kate by not only stalking her by taking explicit pictures of her without her knowing.The text to Joe from the killer telling him to kill Kate could've been a test from him not a real request.
P51: Roald's arrogance looks to be predatory confidence.
P52: Roald has clear motives: jealousy, rivalry, and obsession for hating Malcolm for dating Kate Simon for taking up time and potentially putting her at risk and Gemma for constantly upsetting her.
P53: Roald has a documented history of violence.
P54: Roald has threatened Joe before even attacking him physically and held Joe at gunpoint twice.
P55: Roald had access to every single crime scene around both the nights they were killed as well as an alarming amount of weapons including a knife collection which could imply he has the tools to kill people as well and an implied skillset to stalk Joe because he stalks Kate.
P56: Roald invited Joe to Hampshire and the killer heavily implied that he was planning on inviting or meeting Joe there.
C16: Roald is most likely the suspect.
P57: Roald accuses Joe of being the eat the rich killer and being obsessed with Kate
P58: Roald also uses this to sentence Joe to death and actively hunt him

P59: if Roald is the most likely suspect then he is actively trying to pin his crimes on somebody else and he already hated Joe so he has them to kill him as he was the one getting closer to kate
C17: Roald is trying to frame Joe for being the eat the rich killer due to being close to kate and framing Joe with his own motives

The killer would have to be someone close to or at least related to the group. Roald resented both Simon and Malcolm and openly admitted distasteful behavior of them Roald had previously been notably aggressive with people close to Kate and has shown he has been obsessed with her for a long period of time even having pictures of her in his camera Roald has a large concerning knife collection that can be used to kill people and he has shown violent behaviors like trying to harm others close to Kate even threatening Joe at gunpoint twice. Roald is the perfect suspect killing those close to Kate for his own personal benefit and obsession
It looks like that Roald was trying to frame Joe for killing Gemma and claiming Joe is obsessed with Kate when in reality it's Roald with the obsession Roald was notably aggressive and often angry. He has a motive/connection for to the killings
The killer would have to be someone with access to the rich group or atleast be connected to it in some way to make it to events like Simon's gallery or the castle the killer likely has some connection to the group. Roald had acted aggressively towards people becoming either close to Kate or threatening Kate's interest before, and now they are all ending up dead
He had acted hostile towards Joe whom was becoming close with Kate Roald was the one who proposed the idea of the killer being Joe and that Joe's motivation was Joe was killing people to get closer to Kate and cause he has resentment towards the rich it would seem from the police's/Groups POV that Roald proposed this to lay the groundwork to frame Jonathan/Joe with his own motivation (that being obsessively in love with Kate). Roald also has multiple different

pictures of Kate, some even being explicit or perverse he also has an alarming knife collection. Roald has the motivation. He also has a personal connection to the group. Joe is getting closer to Kate and Roald always wanted to be with her, Roald might have killed Malcolm because he was with Kate rather than him, and he might have killed Simon because he was a threat to Kate's career, finally, Roald might have invited Joe to Hampshire to kill him and frame him. Roald also has all the tools money power and skillset to kill them he has weapon collections a experience in stalking and he has the deeply personal connection to do the grand theatrics of the killer cutting off limbs taunting Joe by text playing with his food Roald was the perfect suspect.

Why would Joe scale to this?

Rhys is basically an alternate personality made from a portion of the original Joe. He's only a portion of the mind so Joe should scale MASSIVELY above this. Also a side note joes deductions do have extra details but the reason I couldn't include it as Rhys and Joe reason/function independently an example is Adam warned Joe Malcom might blackmail him which made Joe think why would Adam warn him about it it makes it less likely him or how Joe did have some stuff about Kate etc but I couldn't include it cause well know doesn't know about this if he did kinda defeats the whole purpose about him making the list if Joe just gives him the answers just came to the logical conclusion so Rhys has access to Joes memories like when Malcom insulted Marriane or got called out by Gemma but he does not have Joes thoughts of thinking process this doesn't weaken the feat at all as Rhys only has some of Joes memories and it's not all of Joes memories at all as he is texting Joe speaking to him or etc so only when Joe is doing his own investigation or research is when Rhys has control to plan or text Joe when Joe is asleep that's when he has time

to check or a look into Joes memories not what Joe is thinking or reasoning so Rhys is basically using joes memories predicting the list from scratch so I can include those details now also Rhys is a actively updating his list as the season goes Roald was the endgame always but as more events happen Rhys updates his hypothesis not to mention again Rhys time in Joes mind is limited only when Joe is sleeping blacked out or not being active is when Rhys has acess my previous point of when Joe is investigating is a timeframe for Rhys could be true yes but considering during that time Rhys is planning doing the list sending messages and even planting evidence the only timeframe he has is when Joe is sleeping Rhys is basically checking cameras after the day is over Rhys is checking blurry cameras with no audio (meaning he can't see joes thoughts and it's mainly Joe staring at people) so it makes it more diffcult for him. This is further proven when Rhys is revealed Joe and Rhys don't know what eachother are thinking yes they understand each other but Rhys can't look into joes thoughts neither then Joe many examples of Rhys knowing what Joe will do but he can't look into what Joe is thinking fully so why would it be any different pre reveal.

Logical and Indirect manipulation, misdirection and concealment

Rhys is manipulating Joe by making him follow this false reasoning chain by non-direct methods(like speaking or any form of communication directly). He's also doing this to conceal the fact that Rhys(alternate personality of Joe) is actually the real killer until he chooses to reveal himself.

When could Rhys have made these predictions ?

We know that Rhys was made by Joe when he bangs his head on the glass cage for one so it must be past that, so let's say that one week

after he becomes a professor and meets Malcolm. Then, let's say 2-3 months pass by since Marianne was still getting food from Rhys for a somewhat long time. Then, Joe saves Kate, Malcolm's girlfriend and he shows gratitude by inviting him to Sundry House, yada yada, then Rhys kills Malcolm. I bet that it is most likely that when Joe was drugged, THAT would be the perfect opportunity for Rhys to start thinking as now he knows everyone and with Malcolm vulnerability also logically speaking when Joe blacked out we see glimpses of him chatting with people yet he doesn't fully remember this could also have been Rhys collecting information about each person via gossip we do see Joe chatting with Sophie then Phoebe crying and etc so this also gave Rhys the chance to dig deeper on each person to further understand them cause he only had some of their life from social media even Joe learned very quickly about each of them when he jsut arrived to sundry house. Mind you during that time joes body was full of hardcore drugs alcohol and other things the riches made him drink so he had to start making complex deductions gather info speak to people plan things under those effects again Joe was given absence or whatever drink but he was given numerous shots of it when he was drunk and also drugged even Phoebe stated herself it's extremely strong and the wallpaper will be talking to him ofc not literally but Joe hasn't drank it before so he was under hardcore alcohol and drugs when making his list mind you Joe rarely ever drank in the show and was only under acid once by forty so he is basically inexperienced in handling the level of alcohol and drugs they gave him which again to drink they gave him was a drink stronger then vodka with a extreme alcohol amount of 45-70 percent so add that with many shots drugs and other substances they gave him. This shows he thought of all of this in an extremely short timeframe.

Logical Reasoning

Deductive: C1-3, C10, and C12

Inductive: C4-7, C11, C13

Abductive: C9, C14-15

C16 is all 3

Abductive>Inductive>Deductive

Accuracy

All of Joes and Rhys conclusions about them were 100 percent correct the only one not is obviously Roald even then the profile of him being in love with Kate being arrogant and etc was accurate the only thing that wasn't was him being the killer but besides that each profile on them was accurate to their complete personality behaviors etc and it was shown to be correct by the show itself like Adam later tells Joe all he cares about is money more than anything or Phoebe is just a medicated mess. Another thing is Joe always keeps an alternate option either Kate is just mad at Malcom or she killed him and trying to cover it up or Gemma's dumb act could be plausible good acting and that Adam could be a stunted typical American man or a serial killer/framer he always had another option to fallback on making sure to always be careful and not dismiss suspects.

How does it fair against suspect list feat from The Mentalist (in terms of reasoning and manipulation and deception)

This feat is logically much harder and complex for 2 reasons in total:

1. RJ made the other suspects purposefully act suspicious which would make it a much easier process in comparison to this feat

not only that he has a massive amount of resources to make it easier example people to examine Jane's notes even if a fake list it could've helped plant bugs in rooms cross reference who Jane has worked with for the handshake rule basically making most of the hard work much easier and basically requiring red John to do basic Jack shit or very little in the actual making of the list + how are we even certain he did the list himself if could be possible that he just made his people do the list for him or heavily influence the making of it the association did most of the work they collected the data the info etc John had massive advantages Rhys had nobody with little money or resources it also matches the narrative the show gave about red John he's a narcissistic old man who is insecure with a god complex.

2. It has nearly twice the suspects needed to be evaluated