Light’s memory loss plan debunk rebuttal

Made by: Hans

I think debunking the memory loss plan as being luck based or plot armor is just a convenient and lazy excuse to discredit Light given the overwhelming majority of people watching and reading Death Note were rooting for L especially because he was at a seemingly overwhelming disadvantage (I disagree with it being an overwhelming disadvantage but that's a different topic). If you actually unpack the plan in the manga (as manga goes more in depth), the foundation of the plan makes sense. The reason I use the word 'unpack' specifically is because Light doesn't explain everything in full 100% detail which makes sense because a manga chapter can only be 20 pages. He explains the majority of his plan and the rest can be inferred and deduced from the information we've already gotten. His plan involves a series of predictions on what he thinks will happen after his memories are given up. The majority of these predictions are based on his emotional understanding of humans, specifically L and what he thinks L will do as well as the taskforce and the nature of power-hungry, ambitious and greedy individuals.

a. First thing that people criticize. Light tells Rem to give the death note to someone of 'some status' who lusts for power. This is a popular criticism as Higuchi ended up being the perfect fake Kira for Light and L to catch. However it never had to be Higuchi as this is just basic psychology, EU and logical reasoning at play. Light deliberately specifies someone of 'some status' as it needs to be someone who is still trying to ascend their way through the social hierarchy, who is high up in the world and social standing relative to the normal person but still nowhere near the top. Before the Death Note, Yotsuba would have just been a smaller sized corporation so Rem really could have given it to an executive in any small corporation who is power hungry and ambitious (will sacrifice basic morals if it advantages them) and the same results would have followed.

b. L will imprison Light (duh). Light logically manipulates L into placing him in solitary confinement but L doesn’t really have a choice given the circumstances. Despite L acknowledging he doesn’t like where the situation is going, he makes the decision to place Light in solitary confinement.

c. L will not want to release light or misa but will be forced to by the other members of the taskforce (exactly what happened, Light knows L will suspect him no matter what but knows the other taskforce members like Light and in the face of 'concrete evidence' will demand Light and Misa's release on ethical grounds)

d. Light will have his watch after being released even if it's confiscated during his solitary confinement as there is no reason to suspect the watch of anything further than what it is, a watch. The taskforce including L also wouldn't consider the possibility of the watch being more as their thinking would be that there's no way someone would carry self-incriminating evidence when turning themselves in (just basic logical reasoning, some deduction etc etc)

e. Light will want to solve the case of the new Kira due to him having been arrested and accused of Kira's crimes despite being innocent (good self-awareness from Light and EU from Light again as he's imagining what he would do if he didn't have the notebook. Seems easy at first until you remember that Light has changed in several ways from before he had the notebook and it's been several months since then)

f. Light predicts L will want to keep a very close eye on him due to still suspecting him and predicts it is highly likely given L's personality as a result that he will ask Light to work with him just like he did originally when Light was first suspected. This is because L knows that Light working with him is a win-win as L explained to Light and the taskforce already. Working with Light means if Light is guilty then he may slip up and reveal himself and if Light is innocent then he is of help to solving the case due to his detective skills (again good EU from Light and just more deductive and inductive reasoning in regards to what will happen given the nature of L)

g. Following on from the last point you can then deduce that despite who solves the case first, due to L keeping a very close eye on Light and them very likely working together, either Light will get his hands on the notebook first or L will and if L does Light will be close by.

h. This is the first bit of proper abductive reasoning Light uses (and is the second main criticism of his plan). Light predicts that he should get his hands on the notebook shortly after or just before or around the same time and that it will most likely be around the same time L touches the notebook. This isn't 100% but given that L will be seeing a shinigami for the first time, it is easy to infer L will be in a state of shock with all or close to all of his attention/focus on the shinigami. Since humans are naturally curious it's then obvious memoryless Light will want to see and touch the notebook too.

i. Light has memories back. Light has already thought of in advance what to do here. He will corroborate the names in the notebook with the victims as a guise to buy time holding it. Decent plan as it isn't fully reasonable for L to believe Light has now just regained his memories but it is possible. However If L does demand the notebook back there is an easy counter to this. Light just takes the scrap from his watch out into his other hand and writes the name. He can easily do this while giving the notebook back or after as Light is shown to be ambidextrous already in the potato chip scene. Plan proceeds as normal.

j. Has instructed Misa in advance through the buried death note and letter to kill L. Plan should have ended here if Misa wasn't a person with below average / average memory. Misa forgets but Light has a contingency plan for this already prepared too. He instructs Misa to begin killing again which forces Rem's hand of killing L (as killing Light here would mean Misa would still die as she'd continue to write names) both ridding Light of his two biggest hindrances Rem and L.

And now after explaining all that, is it really reasonable to put all of that in 20 pages which are mostly going to be pictures? No. The authors put what is necessary and the rest can be inferred and deduced as I've just done so here with my analysis. I truly think Light's memory loss plan is one of the greatest planning feats I've seen in animanga.